Valuation: VCM ATQs "ESOP Valuation - model and issues"





VALUATION STANDARDS BOARD
THE INSTITUTE OF CHARTERED ACCOUNTANTS OF INDIA

(Set up under an Act of Parliament)

New Delhi

Series-9

Valuation: VCM ATQs "ESOP Valuation - model and issues"



Valuation Standards Board
The Institute of Chartered Accountants of
India

Page **1** of **39**

Preamble

Valuation Standards Board of ICAI (VSB) had organised a live Virtual CPE Meeting(VCM) on the topic- "ESOP Valuation - model and issues" on 18th July, 2021. The details of the VCM are as under:

President ICAI: CA. Nihar N. Jambusaria

Vice President ICAI: CA. Debashis Mitra

Address by: CA. Anil Bhandari, Chairman, VSB, ICAI

CA. M. P. Vijay Kumar, Vice- Chairman, VSB, ICAI

Speaker: CA. T.V. Balasubramanian, Registered Valuer

Director: Shri Rakesh Sehgal, Director, ICAI

Secretary: CA. Sarika Singhal, Deputy Secretary, ICAI

The Webcast received an overwhelming response and was attended by more than 1700 viewers. The said webcast can be viewed again at https://live.icai.org/vsb/vcm/18072021/

There were many questions raised during the webcast. We have prepared answers to the questions (ATQs) raised during the webcast, which do not require application of valuation practices and principles. Also, repetitive questions and questions not related to the subject matter have not been answered.

We would also like to mention that the Valuation Standards Board has brought out many publications and Concept papers that may be referred for guidance and reference. All the below publications are available on the Committee link at ICAI website i.e., www.icai.org.

- ICAI Valuation Standards 2018
- Educational Material on ICAI Valuation Standard 103 Valuation Approaches and Methods
- Educational Material on ICAI Valuation Standard 301 Business Valuation

- Valuation: Professionals' Insight- Series- I, II, III, IV, V and VI
- Answers to the Questions raised during the Live Webcast on "Valuation and Valuation Standards Compliance and other aspects under various Laws"
- Technical Guide on Valuation
- Frequently Asked Questions on Valuation
- Concept Paper on findings of Peer Review of Valuation Reports
- Concept Paper on All About Fair Value
- Sample Engagement Letter for accepting Valuation assignment
- Valuation: VCM ATQ's Series I, II, III, IV, V and VI

The answers have been given for reference purposes. Detailed analysis may be done, and other material may be referred.

Valuation Standards Board New Delhi 31st July, 2021

© The Institute of Chartered Accountants of India

All rights reserved. No part of this booklet may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, electronic mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without prior permission, in writing, from the publisher.

DISCLAIMER: This ATQs booklet does not constitute professional advice. The information in this publication has been obtained or derived from sources believed by Valuation Standards Board of ICAI to be reliable. Any opinion or estimates contained in this booklet represent the judgement of Valuation Standards Board of ICAI at this time. Readers of this booklet are advised to seek their own professional advice before taking any course of action or decision, for which they are entirely responsible, based on the contents of this publication. Valuation Standards Board of ICAI neither accepts nor assumes any responsibility or liability to any reader of this booklet in respect of the information contained within it or for any decisions readers may take or decide not to or fail to take.

The material contained in this booklet may not be reproduced, whether in part or in whole, without the consent of Valuation Standards Board of ICAI.

A Brief Note on Option Valuation

1. Introduction

An option provides the holder with the right to buy or sell a specified quantity of an underlying asset at a fixed price (called a strike price or an exercise price) at or before the expiration date of the option.

A call option gives the buyer of the option the right to buy the underlying asset at the exercise price, at any time prior to the expiration date of the option. The buyer pays a price for this right. If at expiration, the value of the asset is less than the strike price, the option is not exercised and expires worthlessly. If, on the other hand, the value of the asset is greater than the strike price, the option is exercised, and the buyer of the option buys the asset at the exercise price.

A put option gives the buyer of the option the right to sell the underlying asset at the exercise price, at any time prior to the expiration date of the option. The buyer pays a price for this right. If the value of the underlying asset is greater than the strike price, the option will not be exercised and will expire worthlessly. If on the other hand, the value of the underlying asset is less than the strike price, the owner of the put option will exercise the option and sell the asset at the strike price.

2. Some popular options in business

A number of business situations have characteristics of options that ultimately affect the valuations of their intangibles. Accordingly, such options have to be valued. Some of the prominent ones are illustrated below:

- (i) **Natural resource companies**, such as oil and mining companies, generate cash flows from their existing reserves but they also have undeveloped reserves that they can develop if they choose to do so. They will be much more likely to develop these reserves if the price of the resource (oil, gold, copper) increases.
- (ii) A patent provides a company with the right to develop and market a product or service and thus can be viewed as an option. While an undeveloped patent may not be

financially viable today and doesn't generate cash flows as of the valuation date, it can still have considerable value to the company owning it because it can be developed in the future.

(iii) Employee Stock Options carry the right, but not the obligation, to buy a certain number of shares in a company at a predetermined price and present a need for using option valuation techniques. Employee Share Options Plan or ESOP is an option provided by a company to its employees. These options provide an option to the employees to purchase the company's shares on future dates at a pre-determined price.

3. Variables impacting Option Valuation

The value of an option is determined by a number of variables relating to the underlying asset and financial markets, some of these variables are as under:-

- **Current value of the Underlying Asset:** Options are assets that derive value from an underlying asset. Consequently, changes in the value of the underlying asset affect the value of the options on that asset. Since calls provide the right to buy the underlying asset at a fixed price, an increase in the value of the asset will increase the value of the calls. Puts, on the other hand, become less valuable as the value of the asset increases.
- Variance in value of the Underlying Asset: The buyer of an option acquires the right
 to buy or sell the underlying asset at a fixed price. The higher the variance in the value
 of the underlying asset, the greater will be the value of the option. This is true for both
 calls and puts.
- Dividends paid on the Underlying Asset: The value of the underlying asset can be
 expected to decrease if dividend payments are made on the asset during the life of the
 option. Consequently, the value of a call on the asset is a decreasing function of the size
 of expected dividend payments, and the value of a put is an increasing function of
 expected dividend payments.
- **Strike Price of Option:** A key characteristic used to describe an option is the strike price. In the case of calls, where the holder acquires the right to buy at a fixed price, the value of the call will decline with an increase in the strike price. In the case of puts, where the holder has the right to sell at a fixed price, the value will increase with an increase in the strike price.
- Time to Expiration on Option: Both calls and puts become more valuable as the time

to expiration increases. This is because the longer time to expiration provides more time for the value of the underlying asset to move, increasing the value of both types of options. Additionally, in the case of a call, where the buyer has to pay a fixed price at expiration, the present value of this fixed price decreases as the life of the option increases, increasing, in turn, the value of the call.

Risk-free Interest Rate Corresponding to the Life of Option: Since the buyer of
an option pays the price of the option upfront, an opportunity cost is involved. This cost
will depend upon the level of interest rates and the time to expiration of the option. The
risk-free interest rate also enters into the valuation of options when the present value of
the exercise price is calculated, since the exercise price does not have to be paid
(received) until expiration on calls (puts). Increases in the interest rate will increase the
value of calls and reduce the value of puts.

4. Option Pricing Models

Various option pricing models, which work on a number of assumptions and inputs, are used to arrive at the value of options. In practice, Black-Scholes and a simpler Binomial Model are preferred for option pricing.

a) The Black-Scholes Model

The Black-Scholes Model is a mathematical formula for calculating the theoretical value of call and put options that may be derived from the assumptions of the model. The fundamental insight of Black-Scholes is that the call option is implicitly priced if the share is traded.

The following assumptions are pertinent while utilising the Black- Scholes Model:

- (a) Share pays no dividends.
- (b) Option can only be exercised upon expiration.
- (c) Market direction cannot be predicted.
- (d) No commissions are charged for the transaction.
- (e) Interest rates remain constant.
- (f) Share returns are normally distributed, thus volatility is constant over time.

b) The Binomial Model

The Binomial Model produces a binomial distribution of all the possible paths that a share price could take during the life of the option. A binomial distribution, simply known as a "Binomial Tree", assumes that a share can only increase or decrease in price all the way until the option expires and then maps it out in a "tree". It then fills in the theoretical value of that share's options at each time step from the very bottom of the binomial tree all the way to the top, where the final, present, theoretical value of a share option is arrived. Any adjustments to share prices at an ex-dividend rate or option prices as a result of early exercise of options are worked into the calculations at each specific time step.

The Binomial Model provides flexibility of early exercisable behavior that may be incorporated for valuing American options. For perspective, the primary distinction between American and European options relates to when the options can be exercised. A European option may be exercised only at the expiration date of the option, i.e., at a single pre-defined point in time. However, an American option can be exercised at any time before the expiry of the option. The Binomial Model is said to be more accurate particularly for longer dated options since it is able to handle a variety of conditions.

c) The Monte Carlo Simulation Model

In addition to the Black-Scholes and the Binomial Model, the Monte Carlo Simulation Model is also used to estimate the value of an option with multiple sources of uncertainty or with complicated features. The Monte Carlo Simulation Model is deployed to:

- (i) generate a large number of possible (but random) price paths for the underlying stock through the method of simulation;
- (ii) calculate the respective payoff of the option for each path; and
- (iii) use these payoffs to estimate the fair value of the option.

Compared to the Black-Scholes and Binomial Model, the Monte Carlo Simulation Model is more complicated and resource intensive. The model is applied only in cases requiring incorporation of multiple level of uncertainty in the inputs considered for the option valuation.

5. Tax Implications on ESOP

Employee Stock Options are generally taxed at two stages in the hands of employees:-

(i) First levy occurs when the option is exercised by Employee – At the time of allotment, the difference between the fair market value of the share and the amount paid by the employee to purchase the shares is taxed as perquisite in the hands of the employee as it is the benefit earned by the employee. This is included as part of the employee salary, and tax is liable to be paid in the year of exercise of the option. The company issuing ESOP is responsible to deduct TDS on the perquisite value as on the date of exercise.

As per Section 17 read with Rule 3(8) of Income Tax Act, ESOPs and equity settled SARs are to be valued by a merchant banker at the time option is exercised, to determine the perquisite value in the hands of the employee.

Amendments introduced vide Budget 2020 for Startups

Finding buyers for shares of a Startup is often complicated as these are generally not listed and hence there is no active market for shares received vide ESOP. Income Tax Act was amended to provide relief to 'eligible startups' in respect of tax on ESOP after considering various representations and understanding the genuine hardship faced by startups.

From the FY 2020-21, an employee receiving ESOPs from an eligible start-up need not pay tax in the year of exercising the option. The TDS on the 'perquisite' stands deferred to earlier of the following events:

- Expiry of five years from the year of allotment of ESOPs
- Date of sale of the ESOPs by the employee
- Date of termination of employment
- (ii) Sale of shares acquired vide scheme by employees the second tax levy occurs when the employees choose to sell the shares acquired by him through ESOP. This is treated like any other capital gains on sale of shares and the same will be short-term or long-term depending upon the holding period. Normally, in the calculation of capital gains, the cost of acquisition is deducted from the sale considered, however in the case of ESOP the cost of share will be the fair value on the date of exercise of the option. This is because

the employee already paid tax on the fair value on the date of exercise.

6. Brief discussion on Guidance Note on Accounting for Share-based Payments issued by ICAI in 2020

Shares and share options comprise a significant element of the total remuneration package of senior personnel; a trend encouraged by the current consensus that it is a matter of good corporate governance to promote significant long-term shareholdings by senior management, so as to align their economic interests with those of shareholders.

Apart from using share-based payments to compensate employees for their services, such payments are also used by an employer as an incentive to the employees to remain in its employment and to reward them for their efforts in improving its performance. Unlisted companies, in particular start-up companies, often give share-based compensation since they cannot afford to pay high salaries to their employees but are willing to share the future prosperity of the company

Such plans generally take the forms of:

- **a) Employee Stock Option Plans (ESOP)** ESOPs are plans under which an enterprise grants options for a specified period to its employees to purchase its shares at a fixed or determinable price.
- **b) Employee Stock Purchase Plans (ESPPs)** ESPPs are plans under which the enterprise grants rights to its employees to purchase its shares at a stated fair value at the time of public issue or otherwise (such ESPPs are outside the scope of share-based payment plan under this Guidance Note).
- c) Stock Appreciation Rights (SARs) SARs is a form of employee share-based payments whereby the employees become entitled to a future cash payment or shares based on the increase in the price of the shares from a specified level over a specified period.

Accounting

A share-based payment plan within the scope for this Guidance Note can be accounted for by adopting the fair value method or the intrinsic value method as on the measurement date.

The Measurement date is the date at which the fair value of the equity instruments granted is measured for the purposes of this Guidance Note. For transactions with employees and others providing similar services, the measurement date is grant date.

a) Fair Value Method

For transactions measured by reference to the fair value of the equity instruments granted, an enterprise shall measure the fair value of equity instruments granted at the measurement date, based on market prices if available, taking into account the terms and conditions upon which those equity instruments were granted (subject to the requirements of paragraphs 28-33).

If market prices are not available, the enterprise shall estimate the fair value of the equity instruments granted using a valuation technique to estimate what the price of those equity instruments would have been on the measurement date in an arm's length transaction between knowledgeable, willing parties.

b) Intrinsic Value Method

Intrinsic value, in the case of a listed company, is the amount by which the fair value (in this case the quoted market price) of the underlying share exceeds the exercise price of an option. If the quoted market price is not available on the grant date, then the share price nearest to that date is taken. In the case of a non-listed company, since the shares are not quoted on a stock exchange, value of its shares is determined on the basis of a valuation report from an independent valuer.

It is recommended that accounting for share-based payment plans should be based on the fair value approach as described in paragraphs 18 to 71. However, intrinsic value method as described in paragraph 64 is also permitted.

Kindly refer to the Guidance note for further details and illustrations. The Guidance Note is available at the below link:-

https://resource.cdn.icai.org/61670research50201gn-sbp.pdf

Answer to Questions raised during the Virtual CPE Meeting Series "Sundays with Valuation Experts" on the topic "ESOP Valuation – model and issues" held on 18^{th} July, 2021

S. No	Question	Answer
1.	What are Employee Stock Options	ESOPs are plans under which an enterprise grants
	(ESOPs)?	options for a specified period to its employees to
		purchase its shares at a fixed or determinable
		price. The ESOPs are schemes under which the
		employees can benefit from the value growth in
		the equity of the company as the company
		compensates its employees by granting them
		options at an exercise price and on meeting
		certain performance criteria.
		ESOPs enable a company to compensate its
		employees without cash outflow but with some
		dilution to the equity. Additionally, balancing the
		cost-benefit between equity dilution through the
		ESOP and the cash outflow is something that
		needs to be considered by the management while designing the scheme.
		designing the scheme.
		In general, such employee benefit are given by
		way of options to acquire equity or alternatively
		can also be given by providing Share Appreciation
		Rights (SARs) / Phantom Shares which could
		themselves be equity settled or cash settled in
		due course.
		ESOP schemes have the following important
		features:
		a) Grant – This is the grant of options to the
		employees subject to some performance
		criteria being met.

- b) Grant Date The date on which the grant of options was made to the employee is called Grant Date.
 c) Performance criteria The performance
- criteria for becoming eligible to exercise the options could be any of the following:A simple lapse of time, certain business parameters such as profitability/revenue being reached, the market price being reached etc.
- **d) Vesting period** It is the period over which the performance criteria are expected to be met and after which the options will become vested with the employee.
- e) Exercise period This is the period after vesting, over which the employee has the right to exercise his option i.e.. opt to take the shares or let it lapse.
- f) Exercise price (or strike price) This is the price to be paid by the employee at the time of exercise to acquire the share available to the employee under the option.
- 2. What is the number of valuations required in an ESOP and when all?

ESOP generally requires valuation at the time grant is being affected. However, in case of unlisted entities, valuation is also required for the shares along with the options as on the date of grant. These are required for accounting of the option costs in accordance with IND AS and IGAAP.

Thereafter, at the time of exercise, valuation is required for the shares (in case of unlisted shares), for determining the perquisite value taxable in the hands of employees under Income Tax Act.

		In certain cases of ESOPs where the performance
		·
		criteria include items such as exercise price being
		varied based on performance etc., there may be
		a need to revise the valuation of options at each
		period end for accounting the option costs based
		on updated estimates. Such valuation would be
		required in case of SARs also.
3.	What is the regulatory requirement	Entities covered by Ind AS are required to adhere
	for valuation of ESOP for accounting	to Ind AS 102: Share-Based Payments in case
	purposes?	they issue ESOPs. According to Ind AS 102, there
		is a need for valuation of the options (and
		valuation of shares in case of unlisted entities) at
		the time of grant of options.
		In respect of entities which are covered by IGAAP
		one needs to adhere to Guidance Note on
		Accounting for Share-based Payments issued by
		ICAI.
		ICAI.
		According to the Guidance Note, option cost may
		be determined based on the fair value of options
		or on the intrinsic value method, however, the
		fair value of options method is the recommended
		method.
		metriod.
		In the entities where intrinsic value method is
		being adopted, valuation of shares is only
		required as on the date of the grant and the
		difference, if any, between the value of share on
		. ,,
		the grant date and the exercise price is treated
4		as the employee benefit cost of the options.
4.	What is the regulatory requirement	As per Section 17 and Rule 3(8) of Income Tax
	for the valuation of ESOP for	Act, ESOPs and equity settled SARs are to be
	taxation purposes?	valued by a merchant banker at the time option

ATQs by Valuation Standards Board ICAI

		is exercised, to determine the perquisite value in
		the hands of the employee.
		Cash settled SAR are taxed at the amount paid to
		the employee as salary at the time it is exercised.
5.	When is valuation for accounting	In certain cases of ESOPs where the performance
	required for ESOP during the	criteria include items such as exercise price being
	vesting period in addition to the	varied based on performance etc., there may be
	initial grant date time valuation?	a need to revise the valuation of options at each
		period end, for accounting the option costs based
		on the updated value estimates.
		Such valuation would also be required in case of
		SARs.
6.	Is SAR valuation different from	In respect of SAR, which is cash settled or equity
	ESOP valuation?	settled, as the settlement is not fixed upfront,
		there will be a requirement for valuation at each
		period end date until completion of the exercise
		as the estimated cost of SAR will be revised at
		each period end.
7.	Who is to do the valuation of ESOP?	At the time of Grant (and period end) for the
		purpose of Accounting of ESOP cost, valuation
		shall be done by a Registered Valuer.
		, -
		At the time of exercise for taxation purposes,
		valuation shall be done by a Merchant Banker.
8.	Is valuation required for ESOP at	As explained earlier, in certain cases of ESOPs
	each period end?	where the performance criteria include items
		such as exercise price being varied based on
		performance etc., there may be a need to revise
		the valuation of options at each period end, for
		accounting the option costs based on the updated
		value estimates. Such valuation would also be
		required in case of SARs.

9.	Which is the preferred method used	The	most preferred method for valuing options
	for ESOP Valuation?	und	er ESOP is the Black Scholes method.
		In s	some cases of complex performance criteria
		beir	ng prescribed in the ESOP scheme, the Black
		Sch	oles model may not be adequate and there
		may	be a need to work out the option valuation
		usin	g the Binomial model.
		Furt	ther for cases where multiple scenarios need
		to b	e factored, the Monte Carlo Simulation could
		be ι	used.
10.	Please explain some of the terms	In t	the standard Black Scholes Merton model,
	related to ESOP valuation?	ther	re are six variables that are used to determine
		the	option value. They are as under:
		i)	Current Market Price – This is the value
			per share of the company based on the listed
			market price and in case of unlisted entities,
			based on valuation of the share done as on
			the date of grant.
		ii)	Exercise price – This is the price to be paid
			by the employee to acquire the options
			granted to him.
		iii)	Time to maturity – This is the time period
			in which the option is expected to be
			exercised and is generally the total vesting
			period plus the exercise period unless early
			exercise is expected. Factors to be
			considered in determining the time to
			expiry/time to maturity is covered in a
			separate question below.
		iv)	Risk Free Rate – It is the risk-free rate

applicable for the tenure closely matching with the total time to maturity of the option.

- Data for the same could be obtained from the monthly newsletter published in www.fbil.org.in.
- v) Volatility This is the measure of dispersion of the expected movement in the value of the share. How the same could be computed has been dealt with in detail in another question in this document.
- vi) Dividend It is the most probable dividend per annum that the shares are likely to earn during the period when the option is alive. This could be estimated based on past trends, comparable company/ industry payout ratios or expected pay-out ratios.

There are certain other terms that are also important in ESOP valuation, and these are explained hereunder:

- i) Graded vesting Valuation of options has to be done for each graded vesting period separately where a grant is made with the vesting happening in a graded manner, say over, multiple years.
 - e.g., 10,000 options granted to an employee will vest at the end of 1^{st} year 20%, 2^{nd} year 20%, 3^{rd} year 30% and 4^{th} year 30%.
- ii) Tranche options may be granted in different periods and each grant could be a different tranche of options.
- **iii) Expected Forfeitures** When options are granted, there is always a probability that not all employees would meet the performance criteria and some of them may also not get the options vested due to this.

ATQs by Valuation Standards Board ICAI

		These options are known as expected
		forfeitures, and this is adjusted while
		accounting based on the number of shares
		considered in computing the cost of options.
11.	How can the volatility be computed	Volatility is a statistical measure of the dispersion
	and used for ESOP valuation?	of returns for a given security or market index. In
		most cases higher the volatility, riskier the
		security. Volatility is often measured as either the
		standard deviation or variance between returns
		from that security or market index.
		Trom that security of market mack.
		Volatility can be determined from the market
		price of the scrip (comparable scrips in case of an
		unlisted entity) over a long period, by computing
		the deviation from the mean and ascertaining the
		standard deviation therefrom using standard
		formulae and/or excel templates. This can be
		annualized by multiplying the standard deviation
		result by square root of the number of trading
		days in a year.
		There are many other approaches to computing
		volatility that can be considered depending upon
		a case-to-case basis.
12.	How can the time to expiry be	Time to maturity/time to expiry is the time period
	estimated and what are the key	in which the option is expected to be exercised
	considerations in this regard?	and is generally the sum of total vesting period
	_	and the exercise period unless early exercise is
		expected. Factors to consider in determining the
		time to expiry/time to maturity includes:
		, , ,
		Present in the money position;
		The materiality of the exercise amount (as
		well as the market price – exercise price) to
		the overall income level of the employee;
		. , ,

		The quantum of options given to the
		employee;
		Perception and understanding levels of
		employees on the value of the shares and
		future growth;
		The overall exercise period and whether it is
		a reasonable time frame or too long a period;
		The Black Scholes model basically assumes that
		the exercise will happen only on expiry of the
		time period and does not provide for computing
		the value assuming that exercise could happen
		anytime during the exercise period.
		Considering all these, there is a need to apply
		judgement on whether the actual exercise would
		happen only at the expiry of the exercise period
		or whether there are indicators to reflect that
		early exercise of options would be more
		appropriate. The time to expiry/maturity needs to
		be accordingly estimated and considered.
13.	What is the Tax deductibility of the	There is no specific provision in the Income Tax
	ESOP expenditure debited to P&L?	Act dealing with tax deductibility of ESOP cost in
		the hands of the issuer. There have been
		decisions at the tribunal level in various states in
		favour of the assessee's claims for ESOP costs.
		However, in absence of a decision at the Supreme
		Court level on this matter, it is subject to potential
		litigation.
14.	Can the share valuation for ESOP	There could be reconcilable differences between
	cost determination be different from	the share valuation arrived at for ESOP issue vs.
	the valuation arrived at for the	valuation done for fundraise. One of the
	purpose of raising funds by the	differences could be on account of the stake size
	company?	linked discount/premium. Generally, ESOP would
		be for the issue of a minuscule non-controlling
	1	

		interest while fundraise could be for a controlling
		or influencing stake.
		However, the valuer should be always able to
		provide the rationale for the difference in the two
		valuations.
15.	How is ESOP to be considered	Kindly refer Chapter 3, "Treatment of Employee
	during valuation of the company,	Stock Options in Business Valuation", of
	say for a fundraise?	Publication - Valuation: Professionals' Insight-
	Say for a fariaraise.	Series 6.
		Series 6.
		The publication is available at the
		undermentioned link:-
		https://resource.cdn.icai.org/65484vsb52818.pdf
16.	How is ESOP taxed in the hands of	ESOPs (and equity settled SARs) are treated as
10.	the employees? Is this any different	perquisites in the hands of the employees and the
	from SAR – specifically for cash-	value is to be determined by a merchant banker
	settled SAR and equity-settled SAR?	at the time of exercise of the option.
		Cash settled SARs are treated as salary and are
		valued at the amount of cash paid to the
		employee at the time of exercise.
17.	ESOP valuation is purely for	At the time of accounting, one needs to clearly
	Employee benefit purposes, so what	bear in mind the fact that this is for estimating
	factors are to be considered to	the cost of options for accounting and for no
	arrive at their valuation?	other purposes. Accordingly, the whole
		engagement needs to be tempered by materiality
		considerations.
18.	ESOP valuation is done as on the	Rule 3(8) of Income Tax Rules dealing with
	date of allotment or as on the date	perquisite valuation of ESOP shares, mentions
	when the option is exercised by the	that it shall be valued as on the date of exercise.
	employee?	
		In case of unlisted shares, the valuation by the
		merchant banker can be as of the date of exercise
		or any date within 180 days before such exercise
		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,

		date.
19.	A seller has received consideration	The actual taxation would depend on the scheme
	from the company for the surrender	under which such a transaction is happening.
	of rights (prior to exercise of	Normally such occurrences related to ESOP arises
	options) in equity shares of an	when there is a change in shareholding and the
	unlisted company held for more	company is being sold to a new investor, where
	than 36 months. These rights were	the arrangement could provide for:-
	given to the seller by the company	(a) accelerated vesting of shares and acquisition
	under the ESOP scheme.	of the shares or;
	On what value will the same be	(b) rescinding of the rights with compensation
	taxed as capital gains- whether on	being paid for the same in cash etc.
	the consideration received or value	
	of unquoted equity share under	Principally, whether the right which is
	Rule 11UA, kindly clarify?	surrendered is to be treated as a capital asset and
		hence the profit from the sale is to be treated as
		a capital gain or whether the transaction would
		trigger the amount to be treated as part of salary
		income would depend on the detailed nuances of
		each arrangement.
20.	How is the consideration received	As discussed above, whether the right which is
	for the surrender of right to acquire	surrendered is to be treated as a capital asset and
	equity shares under ESOP scheme	hence the profit from sale is to be treated as a
	of the unlisted company shall be	capital gain or whether the transaction would
	valued under income tax for levy of	trigger the amount to be treated as part of salary
	capital gains tax?	income would depend on the detailed nuances of
		each arrangement.
21.	A Stock option is an option in the	In ESOP grants, shares are not allotted at the
	hands of employees, who decide	time of grant and what is being given is only a
	whether to exercise the option or	grant of options which entitles the option holder
	not after the vesting date. However,	to choose to exercise for the share.
	for issuing company whose	
	accounts are under consideration, a	Thus, what is incurred today as a payout to the
	stock option is a	company is an option and not a share and
	liability/commitment towards	accordingly, the payout is valued using option
	employees. Hence, the difference	valuation models which help estimate the cost of

between market price/fair value and exercise/ issue price is amortized over the vesting period and debited to employee remuneration a/c.

For the purpose of IND AS and for issuing company, the stock options have to be valued as per normal valuation methodology like DCF and certainly not by using option valuation methodology like Black Scholes. Please explain how appropriate it is to use option valuation methodology to value options for the purpose of Ind AS?

such options being given. It is important to note that the valuation of options does consider the current market price or valuation of the equity shares computed either based on market quoted prices or based on valuation of shares using accepted methods of valuations.

22. Future convertible instruments can be issued under ESOP? If yes, how is it valued?

For the purpose of accounting, at the time of grant, there would be a need to first and foremost determine the value of the equity and the convertible instruments using valuation methods including Backsolve Method. Once the value of the convertible instrument has been determined, then the option valuation model could be used to determine the value of the option thereof.

At the time of exercise, valuation is to be done as per Rule 3(9), which essentially requires a merchant banker's valuation of the instrument at its fair market value.

23. Under what circumstances Value of options and Value of shares will be the same or different?

The Value of shares and the value of options would generally be different, as the value of shares is the value of the actual asset, and the value of options is only the value of the option to acquire such asset at a given price.

Theoretically, the value of option and value of

		share could be close to each other if the expiry
		date is very close, and the exercise price is near
		zero.
24.	Is it essential for a start-up	As Accounting is done as per the standards of
	company (private limited and	auditing prescribed under the Companies Act and
	unlisted) to do a valuation of shares	the Act requires all valuation under the Act to be
	at the time of grant of ESOPs? Can	done by a registered valuer, hence this valuation
	the company itself value its options	shall be done by a registered valuer.
	or does it need to have a valuation	
	certificate from a registered valuer?	Also, this valuation is essential as it provides an
		independent professional assessment of the
		estimate for the Board to approve and also for
		the Auditors to rely upon.
25.	Is it necessary to value an option	In case of entities covered by Ind AS, the value
	based on the Black Scholes model or	of options needs to be computed using one of the
	it can be valued at some percentage	recognized option valuation models, as
	of market value too?	considered appropriate.
		In case of entities not covered by Ind AS, there is an acceptable alternative treatment of determining the cost of options using the intrinsic value method (the current market value of the share less the exercise price).
26.	Some ESOP schemes are drafted in	In such cases, considering the various factors
	a way in which there is no expiry	which could impact the exercise of option, there
	date for the option exercise period,	has to be judgement exercised in determining the
	apart from stating that they will	time to maturity/time to expiry.
	need to be exercised when the	
	employee leaves, or when there is a	Factors to consider in determining the time to
	liquidity event. How would you	expiry/time to maturity include:
	compute the life of the option in	Likely date of liquidity event;
	such cases?	Likely date of employee leaving the services
		of the company;
		Present in the money position; The second of the sec
		The materiality of the exercise amount (as

		well as the market price – exercise price) to
		the overall income level of the employee;
		• The quantum of options given to the
		employee;
		Perception and understanding levels of
		employees on the value of the shares and
		future growth;
		The overall exercise period and whether it is
		a reasonable time frame or too long a period;
27.	Can there be two Fair Values of the	There could be reconcilable differences between
	same Company? That is, one Fair	the share valuation arrived at for ESOP issue vs.
	Value to raise funds and one Fair	say for fundraise.
	Value for issuing ESOP to	
	employees.	One of the differences could be on account of the
		stake size linked discount/premium – generally
	In my view, only one Fair Value can	ESOP would be for issue of a minuscule non-
	be there and the discount to	controlling interest while fundraise could be for a
	Employees has to be given through	controlling or influencing stake.
	reduced Exercise Price. Please	
	guide.	However, the valuer should be able to provide the
		rationale for the difference between the two
		valuations.
28.	In terms of the grant, can the	Ideal situation is to get the valuation done when
	company take valuation post facto	the grant is made so that the Board can also
	of transaction i.e., after the date of	undertake an independent evaluation of the cost
	the grant?	of the grant to the company.
		However, practically, many a time, the valuation
		exercise is carried out post the grant being
		affected, and then it is used for accounting in the
		concerned period.
29.	Based on the discussion we	Yes. These three valuations are required.
	understand that three valuations	
	are required, share valuation and	ESOP is actually a bright idea for start-ups since
	option valuation at the time of grant	they cannot afford to pay high salaries to their

	and Merchant Banker valuation at	employees but are willing to share the future
	the time of exercise? Kindly confirm.	prosperity of the company.
	It seems that ESOP is a bad idea for	
	small start-ups.	Of course, balancing the cost-benefit between
		equity dilution through the ESOP and the cash
		outflow has to be considered while designing the
		scheme in each case.
30.	i) How do the employees who opt	(i) As the valuation is required to be carried out
	for the ESOP (Before listing of the	by a merchant banker at the time of exercise
	Co.), can come to know whether the	of the option hence there is an independent
	valuation is appropriately done, as	valuation confirmation that can provide
	they must pay perquisites tax?	comfort to the employees on the fairness of
	ii) Are there any restrictions on	the valuation.
	immediate selling of the shares	(ii) No.
	allotted through ESOP upon listing	(iii) The ITR form requires share options
	of the shares?	outstanding amount under reserves to be
	iii) Are the shares of unlisted Co.	shown as a separate item.
	given in ESOP shall be shown	
	separately in the Income Tax return	
	as part of disclosure?	
31.	For the purpose of taxation, it is	At the time of grant of options, valuation for the
	understandable that valuation is to	option is done for the purpose of accounting.
	be done at the time of option	
	exercise, so at the time of allotment	At the time of exercise, valuation is required for
	what all is considered, only the six	the purpose of taxation.
	critical points as mentioned?	
		At the time of allotment, there is no need for any
		separate valuation to be undertaken.
32.	For Ease of operation can a	Yes. There is no prohibition to this.
	Company plan to have grant date	
	and year end date as same?	
33.	Can you please elaborate on how to	In case of unlisted companies, volatility can be
	determine volatility of share price in	computed based on the volatility of comparable
	case of ESOP valuation of an	companies (which are listed). In appropriate
	unlisted company?	cases, the volatility can also be considered based

		on the volatility of some appropriate index of
		stocks.
34.	Internal valuation either under DCF/	For the purpose of accounting, as ESOP valuation
	NAV is sufficient for ESOP?	is essentially done for estimation of the cost to
		the company, materiality considerations can be
		applied and accordingly this judgement has to be
		taken.
35.	Please explain the difference in	Generally, RSUs involve no money to be paid and
	Taxation in the hands of the	on vesting itself the shares are given to the
	employees in ESOPs vs RSUs.	employee and the value of such shares are taxed
		as income in the hands of the employee.
		In case of ESOP, point of taxation arise at the
		time of exercise of the option itself.
36.	There may be circumstances when	As the Rule under Income Tax provides for a
	almost every month end some	window of 180 days, the company could get
	employee exercises the stock	merchant banker valuation for perquisite
	option. Does this mean that the	valuation for all exercises that are affected within
	valuation exercise is to be done	180 days of each such report.
	every month?	
37.	Are only Registered Valuer	It is opined that as the valuation is being done
	authorised for ESOP valuation for	under the Companies Act, which has notified the
	accounting purposes or other	standards, the valuation is to be done by a
	professionals like Chartered	Registered Valuer only.
	Accountant/Actuary can also do	
	valuation for accounting purposes?	However, there are other interpretations also in
		use.
38.	For Private Ltd comparable	A suitable appropriate index can be used.
	company is not available for	
	computation of volatility, can we	
	take index historical volatility rather	
	than company volatility?	
39.	Kindly guide how to determine Risk-	Data for the same could be obtained from the
	free rate?	monthly newsletter published in www.fbil.org.in.

40.	Is there any guidance note available	Reference is invited to Appendix I of the Guidance
	on ESOP Valuation? Please refer to	Note on Accounting for Share-based Payments
	some resources, books and useful	issued by ICAI and Appendix B to the Ind AS 102
	tools.	which gives guidance on this matter.
41.	How does the reduction in period	In case of a listed company, the present market
	impacts the valuation of a listed	price is taken based on market quotes. However,
	Co.?	valuation of option is determined considering
		various factors as discussed above, and one of
		them is the time to expiry/maturity (including any
		early exercise of options).
		The longer the time period, the larger the
		probability of being in the money. Hence, the
		time period to exercise has an impact on the cost
		of the options.
42.	Where there are performance	For detailed guidance please refer to Appendices
	conditions or any other condition	II to XI of the Guidance Note on Accounting for
	mentioned in the ESOP scheme,	Share-based Payments issued by ICAI and
	how can we include/consider these	Appendix B to the Ind AS 102 which gives
	events in computation of ESOP	guidance on this matter.
	valuation.	
		In complex scenarios, simulation using Monte
	Similarly, where there are	Carlo Model could be put to use.
	conditions on exit on shares by	
	founders, how will this be	
	inculcated/included in the valuation	
	activity? Should something on the	
	probability study or simulation be	
43.	used in this?	Dleace refer to the Annandiy II of the Cuidance
43.	Please share an example in excel format for the amortisation over the	Please refer to the Appendix II of the Guidance
	vesting period?	Note on Accounting for Share-based Payments for an example of the working.
	vesurig periou:	Tor an example of the working.
44.	As explained by the speaker there	ESOPs require option valuation to be carried out
'''	are two scenarios under which	at reporting period ends when the performance
	are two sectiones direct which	at reporting period chas when the periorinance

	valuation is required at year-end.	criteria lead to a change in say, exercise price and
	Kindly share both the scenarios	thus the option value is revised.
	again.	
	Also, quote sections or standards	SARs are required to be valued at each period
	where it is quoted that valuation	end as the value of options will have to be revised
	must be done at year-end.	for the updated estimate of the cost of SARs to
		be considered in the accounts.
45.	What is the significance of the Black	For accounting as per Ind AS 102, there are
	Scholes method of options valuation	disclosure requirements for information on
	for the purpose of disclosures in	ESOPs, which largely revolves around the options
	financial statements of an unlisted	valuation model.
	and a listed company?	
46.	At what time Registered Valuer's	Registered Valuer's valuation is required at the
	report will be required and at what	time of grant (and in some cases for reporting
	time Merchant Banker's report will	period ends) for accounting purposes.
	be required?	
	As understood, a Registered Valuer	Merchant Banker's valuation is required for the
	report is required only at year-end	purpose of determination of the taxable amounts
	for accounting purposes, but on	in the hands of the employees.
	what basis can a company frame	
	the policy of ESOP, and who can	Framing the ESOP schemes is more of a
	value the company for this purpose?	management action and advisory could be
		provided by anyone having appropriate skills in
		this area, as this is far beyond just valuation and
		includes multiple aspects such as HR implication
		of the scheme, Retention policies, Pricing of the
		ESOPs, Dilution implications, etc.
47.	For determining the 3 rd input i.e.,	Yes. Time to maturity shall be considered from
	Time to Maturity, shall we take	grant date to the end of the exercise period
	period from the Grant Date?	(subject to changes based on early exercise
		expectations).
48.	What is the time-period used for	A longer time period used for calculating volatility
	calculating volatility? Also, does	would probably provide a more smoothened
	volatility means Standard	output.
	Deviation?	
L	1	

		Vola	atility, if computed using daily market data, is
		the	standard deviation for the period. This can be
		ann	ualized by multiplying the standard deviation
		arri	ved on a daily basis by the square root of the
		nun	nber of trading days in a year.
49.	Kindly reiterate all the six Elements	The	six elements are as under:-
	in ESOP Valuation?	i)	Current Market Price – This is the value
			per share of the company based on the listed
			market price and in case of unlisted entities,
			based on the valuation of the share done as
			on the date of grant.
		ii)	Exercise price – This is the price to be paid
			by the employee to acquire the options
			granted to him.
		iii)	Time to maturity – This is the time period
			in which the option is expected to be
			exercised and is generally the total vesting
			period plus the exercise period unless early
			exercise is expected. Factors to be
			considered in determining the time to
			expiry/time to maturity is covered in a
			separate question below.
		iv)	Risk Free Rate – It is the risk-free rate
			applicable for the tenure closely matching
			with the total time to maturity of the option.
			Data for the same could be obtained from
			the monthly newsletter published in
			www.fbil.org.in.
		v)	Volatility – This is the measure of
			dispersion of the expected movement in the
			value of the share. How the same could be
			computed has been dealt with in detail in
			another question in this document.
		vi)	Dividend – It is the most probable dividend
			per annum that the shares are likely to earn

		during the period when the option is alive.
		This could be estimated based on past
		trends, comparable company/ industry
		payout ratios or expected pay-out ratios.
50.	If we need to calculate volatility	There is no need to have a similar period to the
	based on the last 3 years	time to expiry being taken for computing
	considering the expected term, then	volatility.
	the past period of 3 years shall be	
	considered in totality or as 1 year	If 3 years data is used for computing volatility, it
	and 3 different standard deviations?	should ideally be computed (unless there are
		reasons why the period itself is not
		representative) for the whole period arriving at
		the standard deviation for a day and then this is
		multiplied by the square root of the number of
		trading days in a year for annualizing the
		volatility.
51.	Black Scholes Merton model is	There are modified models available off the
	typically used for valuing European	internet for the basic Black Scholes Merton model
	options. How would you modify this	being tweaked for the American Option criteria.
	to value American options, which	
	are typically what are granted by	However, the simpler approach would be to use
	companies, to arrive at fair value?	judgement on the early exercise of options and
		accordingly put to use the standard model.
		As this valuation is for estimating the cost of
		options for accounting, considerations of
		materiality may be appropriately applied in
		determining these.
52.	Will the high or small number of	Theoretically, this is a possibility.
	options influence Option Price?	Herroren en ble verletilte tresté te en est
	Because, greater the number,	However, as the volatility itself is an estimate
	greater will be the potential dilution	based on various factors, the volatility would
	in future which influences share	change if these factors were applied and
	price. And if the share price is	accordingly can be factored into the
	influenced, the option price will be	determination of the volatility assumed in the

	affected, being a derivative of the	valuation.
	share.	
53.	Where can we find ESOP Valuation	There are sample valuation reports available on
	report, are these available in the	the internet. The valuation reports submitted to
	public domain, if yes, then where?	the company are not public domain information.
	If no, then, will Valuation Standards	
	need to be applied to such ESOP	Valuation standards need to be applied for all
	Valuations as well? Please guide.	valuations carried out by a Registered Valuer.
54.	If the exercise period is based on	The time to maturity needs to be estimated based
	some events like x amount of	on judgement relating to when the venture
	venture capital funding or IPO, then	capital funding or IPO is likely to happen etc.,
	for such a case what should be the	
	average time to maturity?	
55.	How is the cost of ESOP	The cost of ESOP is determined by ascertaining
	determined? How is it amortised?	the fair value of options (under Ind AS and
	How is the gain treated under IT	recommended under IGAAP) or the intrinsic value
	Act, long term or short term?	of options (permitted under IGAAP). The ESOP
		cost is to be amortised over the vesting period for
		each vesting separately.
		The gain to the employee at the time of exercise
		is treated as a perquisite in the hands of the
		employees. After exercise, when the shares are
		sold, the profit/loss on such sale is regarded as
		capital gain/loss from long term or short term
		based on the time period from the exercise.
56.	The question is on disclosures.	In the valuation report, it is ideal to capture all
	Whether all the judgements made	judgements and the rationale thereof.
	by the valuer are to be disclosed?	
57.	For an unlisted entity where the	The time to maturity needs to be estimated based
	exercise is dependent on the	on judgement relating to when the IPO is likely
	occurrence of any event (for e.g.,	to happen etc.
	listing of Company in future date)	
	what can be the total period	
	considered for valuation?	

58.	Whether ESOP/SAR affects the	ESOP / SAR generally do not affect gratuity
	Gratuity valuation? and is a	valuation.
	registered valuer eligible for	
	Actuarial Valuation of Gratuity or	Actuarial valuation for gratuity can be done only
	only an actuary is eligible for	by a registered actuary.
	valuation for the purpose of AS 15 -	
	employee benefit expenses?	
59.	How to determine probability in the	In the Binomial model, the probability is
	Binomial Model?	determined similar to how volatility is determined
		in the Black Scholes Model – based on various
		indicators and comparable data and applying
		judgement to such indicators and data.
60.	Now a days, companies are	Such complex structures would very heavily
	exploring issue of shares upfront to	depend on how the transaction is structured in its
	employees as ESOP, these are	finer details for appropriate consideration under
	allotted to employees and will be	the Companies Act, 2013 and the Income Tax
	bought back if the employee does	Act, and then on a case-to-case basis would have
	not serve the ESOP period, the re-	to be determined specifically.
	purchase by the company will be at	
	the rate purchased by the	
	employee. How will the valuation be	
	impacted and what will be the tax	
	implications?	
61.	How would a surrender	Assuming that the surrender is arising out of
	consideration received from sale of	options given under the ESOP scheme, the
	rights will be valued by Income Tax	opinion is given below:-
	department in case they do not	
	accept the actual consideration	Principally, whether the right which is
	received?	surrendered is to be treated as a capital asset and
		hence the profit from sale is to be treated as a
		capital gain or whether the transaction would
		trigger the amount to be treated as part of salary
		income would depend on the detailed nuances of
		each arrangement.

price used in the last funding be used again? ESOP, materiality considerations can be If the assessment is that the price would materially moved to impact the estimate cost materially, this may be an acceptable cost materially, this may be an acceptable valuation is already done as at grant criteria include items such as exercise price of the cost material include items such as exercise price of the cost material include items such as exercise price of the cost material include items such as exercise price of the cost material include items such as exercise price of the cost material include items such as exercise price of the cost material include items such as exercise price of the cost material include items such as exercise price of the cost material include items such as exercise price of the cost material include items such as exercise price of the cost material include items such as exercise price of the cost material include items such as exercise price of the cost material include items such as exercise price of the cost material include items such as exercise price of the cost material include items such as exercise price of the cost material include items such as exercise price of the cost material include items and the cost material include items are cost material include items and the cost material include items are cost material include items and the cost material include items are cost material include items and the cost material include items are cost material include items and the cost material include items are cost material include items and the cost material include items are cost	applied. not have of ESOP e choice. formance ice being
If the assessment is that the price would materially moved to impact the estimate cost materially, this may be an acceptable 63. Can you please explain, when In certain cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost material cases of the cost m	not have of ESOP e choice. Formance ice being
materially moved to impact the estimate cost materially, this may be an acceptable 63. Can you please explain, when In certain cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost materially moved to impact the estimate cost materially moved to impac	e of ESOP e choice. Formance ice being
materially moved to impact the estimate cost materially, this may be an acceptable 63. Can you please explain, when In certain cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost materially moved to impact the estimate cost materially moved to impac	e of ESOP e choice. Formance ice being
cost materially, this may be an acceptable 63. Can you please explain, when In certain cases of ESOPs where the performance of the cost materially, this may be an acceptable for the cost materially, this may be an acceptable for the cost materially, this may be an acceptable for the cost materially, this may be an acceptable for the cost materially, this may be an acceptable for the cost materially, this may be an acceptable for the cost materially.	e choice. formance ice being
63. Can you please explain, when In certain cases of ESOPs where the perf	formance ice being
	ice being
valuation is already done as at grant criteria include items such as exercise pr	_
, , ,	e may be
date then why should we do varied based on performance etc., there	
valuation again at year-end? a need to revise the valuation of options	s at each
period end for accounting the option cos	sts based
on updated estimates. Such valuation v	would be
required in case of SARs also.	
64. When a start-up is issuing ESOPs There could be reconcilable differences	between
they do a valuation. But assume the share valuation arrived at for ESOP	issue vs.
they also have some rounds of say for fundraise.	
funding in the same year and the	
valuation for fund infusion could be One of the differences could be on accou	ınt of the
different. How do they deal with stake size linked discount/premium - g	jenerally,
this? ESOP would be for the issue of a minuse	cule non-
controlling interest while fundraise could	be for a
controlling or influencing stake.	
However, the valuer should be able to pro-	ovide the
rationale for the difference between	the two
valuations.	
65. It is not mandatory that employees There seems to be no bar against the sa	ime.
have to exercise option at the time	
of leaving the company. The Board	
can extend it at its discretion. Is it a	
correct position?	
66. Kindly share the links for the All the links to previous sessions can be	accessed
recording of all the Valuation from the Valuation Standards Board we	bpage at
Sunday Series Webcast. the ICAI website.	

		Link is as under:-
		http://icai.org/post/valuation-standards-board
67.	Can the time of expiration be taken	Time to expiration is generally the vesting period
	equivalent to the period of vesting?	plus the exercise period, subject to early exercise
		possibilities.
68.	Law says valuation done by a	There is no such legal basis. There are case laws
	Registered Valuer cannot be	stating that when independent valuers have been
	questioned even by the Assessing	engaged for the purpose of valuation, then the
	Officer, is the statement correct?	court will not intervene if it is satisfied that
		valuation has been carried out in accordance with
		the law.
69.	For a listed company, ESOP	Generally, ESOP valuation is to be done only at
	valuation is to be done at year-end	the time of grant for accounting purposes.
	or only at the time of Grant?	
		In certain cases of ESOPs where the performance
		criteria include items such as exercise price being
		varied based on performance etc., there may be
		a need to revise the valuation of options at each
		period end, for accounting the option costs based
		on the updated value estimates. Such valuation
		would also be required in case of SARs.
70.	What is the validity of a valuation	Ideally, valuation should be as of the grant date
	report for ESOP? For e.g.: for grants	(1-Jun-21). As this valuation is solely for
	dated 1-Jun-2021, can we consider	accounting estimate purposes, materiality
	valuation report as on 31-Mar-21	considerations can be applied to determine
	issued on 25th May 2021 for the	whether using a valuation report as of 31.03.21
	purpose of accounting of ESOP	would be acceptable by the management and the
	expense during FY 2021-22?	auditors.
71.	Company issues various series of	At the time of grant, for accounting, there would
	shares, Series A, Series B and Series	be a need to first and foremost determine the
	C ESOP is used under Series D,	value of the equity and all series of equity like
	which has different rights and	instruments, using valuation methods including
	obligation (e.g.: doesn't have voting	Backsolve method. Once the value of these
	right). How do we consider these	different instruments has been determined, then
		the option valuation model could be used to

	factors in the 6 steps discussed in	determine the value of the option thereof.
	option valuation?	
72.	When determining the fair value of	While valuing equity shares, if the income
	equity share of the company, which	approach is being undertaken, then consolidated
	is having investments in the	performance is considered only if the business is
	subsidiary, if the parent company is	similar and integral to each other. Otherwise,
	issuing ESOPs to the employees,	each subsidiary is valued separately using its own
	whether valuation shall be done	parameters and then added to arrive at the
	using consolidated financial	business value of the parent company and the
	statements, or we need to value	final value of the parent company's equity.
	each subsidiary and standalone	
	parent company separately?	In case of graded vesting, each vesting is to be
		valued separately and the accounting for the
	In the case of graded vesting, each	costs will also be spread over the respective
	grant is to be treated as separate	vesting periods.
	(tranches) as the life of the option	
	for each grant will differ? Suppose	
	there are 4 vesting schedules, then	
	shall we use 4 Black Scholes Merton	
	model to arrive at the fair value of	
	the option? Please confirm in	
	accordance with the Guidance Note	
	2020.	
73.	What happens in a scenario, where	One could sell at a loss and use the capital loss in
	an employee has paid tax (TDS) at	the normal manner as per the Income Tax Act.
	the time of exercise of options, but	
	such shares never see any liquidity	
	event!	
	Is there a way to claim the tax paid	
7.	earlier as a refund?	V.
74.	Unlisted Company - can we take	Yes, we can.
	volatility based on future projected	
	returns volatility? (Appendix B30 -	
	Ind AS 102)	

75.	Please share any specific parameter	It is the same as would apply to all valuation of
	to be kept in mind or specific	shares being carried out at any point in time.
	manoeuvre to be done while doing	
	valuation at the time of exercising of	The valuation should be in compliance with the
	option by a Merchant Banker?	approach and methodology as per Valuation
	Asking from Point of View of a	Standards adhered to.
	Merchant Banker.	
76.	Is valuation and accounting of stock	Largely they are similar, except that in respect of
	appreciation rights similar to ESOP?	SARs valuation would be required at each period
		end until its exercise.
		Until the vesting period, the fair value of the
		option is used to determine the cost to be
		accounted and thereafter, the intrinsic value is
		used to determine the cost to be accounted.
77.	In case of thinly traded shares, can	The SEBI (Share Based Employee Benefits)
	valuation be considered as the	Regulations, 2014 define market price as the
	Market value of the share?	latest available closing price.
		Ind AS 102 and Guidance Note on Accounting for
		Share-based Payments issued by ICAI expects
		listed shares to be valued at their market price.
78.	Can Risk-free rate be different for	Yes, for ESOP valuation, for each vesting, the
	underlying shares and those used	risk-free rate considered should be related to the
	for ESOP?	period of the time to expiry.
		For valuation of shares, a general long-term risk-
		free rate is to be considered.
79.	If we have a SAR (cash settled	If a trust is set up, and the required number of
	option) and the valuation of the	shares (equivalent to the SAR shares) are held in
	options is based on the listed	such trust for being sold and distributed to the
	company shares, is there a way	employees, then this could be structured.
	where the market volatility can be	
	taken care of in issuing the	However, based on how the structuring is done,
	company financials, such that	and the nature of the transaction, the taxation
79.	option) and the valuation of the options is based on the listed company shares, is there a way where the market volatility can be taken care of in issuing the	shares (equivalent to the SAR shares) are held in such trust for being sold and distributed to the employees, then this could be structured. However, based on how the structuring is done,

	change in prices does not make the	aspects could also vary.
	P/L volatile and the company also	
	hedge their liability?	However, this method could ensure that there is
		no significant volatility impacting the P&L.
80.	Unlisted Company - can we take	Yes. Reference is invited to para B30 of Ind AS
	volatility based on future projected	102 for guidance in this regard.
	returns volatility?	
81.	Can the Income Tax department ask	Principally, whether the right which is
	for option value in respect of rights	surrendered itself is treated as a capital asset and
	surrendered under the ESOP	the sale is treated as a capital gain or whether
	scheme of an unlisted company?	the transaction would trigger the amount to be
		treated as part of salary income would depend on
		the detailed nuances of each arrangement.
		Having said that, as there has been no payment
		towards the rights by the employee when
		acquiring the same, the cost would probably be
		considered as zero and the capital gains or salary
		on surrender of the rights may be computed
		accordingly.
82.	How can we evaluate whether the	It can be determined based on the ESOP scheme
	ESOP is equity-settled or cash-	document.
	settled?	
83.	In the Black Scholes model, we	Strike Price refers to the exercise price and
	need strike price which is a future	generally, this is determined upfront in the
	element. What are the best reliable	scheme document itself.
	documents to be obtained/referred	
	by a Registered Valuer to ascertain	
	the same?	
84.	Can you give an example of a	Reference is invited to the Guidance Note on
	judgement that is used where there	Accounting for Share-based Payments issued by
	are performance conditions in the	ICAI, Appendix II Illustration 2, 3 and 4 where
	ESOPs/Shares, for example, 10	such examples have been dealt with.
	crore revenue after 2 years, how	

	should we look at this situation from	
	judgement making perspective?	
85.	Would unexpected market	Yes, wherever appropriate. For instance, with the
	conditions like the ongoing	pandemic coming in between, the evaluation of
	pandemic also be considered while	whether employees would exercise early by
	valuing ESOP and determining	paying up the exercise price or would use the
	exercise time frame?	cash for their needs and hold on to the exercise
		for a later date could be considered.
	If yes, how would we consider it?	
86.	Whether volatility will be affected by	Yes, it could be affected.
	future expectations or not?	
87.	Are the shares allocated in ESOP	Reference is invited to Guidance Note on
	forms part of the diluted equity	Accounting for share-based payments issued by
	shares of a company as these are	ICAI – Appendix VII which has explained how the
	yet to be offered to employees?	computation of diluted EPS is to be affected in
		case of ESOPs.
88.	On grant date, the price of the share	If material, existing options prior to the present
	should be determined after	grant can be considered appropriately to
	considering dilution or should it be	determine the value per share by allocating the
	based on the number of shares	total equity value to the existing equity shares
	outstanding as on the valuation	and options using the Backsolve method.
	date?	
89.	Kindly repeat which article was	Kindly refer to chapter 3 of Publication -
	referred to by the speaker.	Valuation: Professionals' Insight- Series 6.
		The publication is available at the
		undermentioned link:-
00	If the conversion ratio of convertible	https://resource.cdn.icai.org/65484vsb52818.pdf
90.	If the conversion ratio of convertible debentures is based on future	The value of the enterprise should be allocated to
	profitability, then in such cases how	the various instruments including convertible debentures and equity-based on Backsolve
	to determine the value of	method. For the conversion ratio, methods such
	debenture?	as Monte Carlo Simulation could be used to
	dependic:	determine appropriate valuation.
		determine appropriate valuation.

91.	How do we account for the forex	It shall also be accounted for based on the
	gain loss in case the holding	currency in which it is to be settled between the
	company charges the subsidiary	holding and the foreign company.
	company for the ESOPs extended?	
92.	Does ESOP have an impact on the	Technically yes, it could have an impact.
	share price in the stock exchange?	



VALUATION STANDARDS BOARD THE INSTITUTE OF CHARTERED ACCOUNTANTS OF INDIA

(Set up under an Act of Parliament) **New Delhi**